

PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT
FOR
COMPENSATION STUDY SERVICES

This Agreement ("Agreement") is made and entered into as of the 7th day of February, 2022, by and between the City of Foster City hereinafter called "CITY" and Koff & Associates, a division of Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. hereinafter called "CONSULTANT".

RECITALS

This Agreement is entered into with reference to the following facts and circumstances:

- A. That CITY desires to engage CONSULTANT to provide professional services in the CITY by preparing a comprehensive compensation study;
- B. That CONSULTANT is qualified to provide such services to the CITY and;
- C. That the CITY has elected to engage the services of CONSULTANT upon the terms and conditions as hereinafter set forth.

- 1. Services. The services to be performed by CONSULTANT under this Agreement shall include those services set forth in Exhibit A, which is, by this reference, incorporated herein and made a part hereof as though it were fully set forth herein.

Performance of the work specified in said Exhibit A is hereby made an obligation of CONSULTANT under this Agreement, subject to any changes that may be made subsequently hereto upon the mutual written agreement of the said parties.

Where in conflict, the terms of this Agreement supersede and prevail over any terms set forth in Exhibit A.

- 2. Term; Termination. (a) The term of this Agreement shall commence upon the date hereinabove written and shall expire upon completion of performance of services hereunder by CONSULTANT. (b) Notwithstanding the provisions of (a) above, either party may terminate this Agreement without cause by giving written notice not less than ten (10) days prior to the effective date of termination, which date shall be included in said notice. In the event of such termination, CITY shall compensate CONSULTANT for services rendered, and reimburse CONSULTANT for costs and expenses incurred, to the date of termination, calculated in accordance with the provisions of paragraph 3. In ascertaining the services actually rendered to the date of termination, consideration shall be given both to completed work and work in process of completion. Nothing herein contained shall be deemed a limitation upon the right of CITY to terminate this Agreement for

cause, or otherwise to exercise such rights or pursue such remedies as may accrue to CITY hereunder.

3. Compensation; Expenses; Payment. CITY shall compensate CONSULTANT for all services performed by CONSULTANT hereunder in an amount based upon CONSULTANT's hourly rates during the time of the performance of said services. A copy of CONSULTANT's hourly rates for which services hereunder shall be performed are set forth in CONSULTANT's fee schedule marked Exhibit "B" hereof, attached hereto and by this reference incorporated herein.

Notwithstanding the foregoing, the combined total of compensation and reimbursement of costs payable hereunder shall not exceed the sum of sixty thousand, three hundred and ninety dollars (\$60,390). Invoices for amounts in excess of sixty thousand, three hundred and ninety dollars (\$60,390) shall not be paid unless the performance of services and/or reimbursement of costs and expenses in excess of said amounts have been approved in advance of performing such services or incurring such costs and expenses by the City Manager (for contracts less than \$50,000) or City Council (for contracts \$50,000 or more) evidenced by motion duly made and carried and a written contract amendment having been executed.

Compensation and reimbursement of costs and expenses hereunder shall be payable upon monthly billing therefor by CONSULTANT to CITY, which billing shall include an itemized statement, briefly describing by task and labor category or cost/expense items billed.

4. Additional Services. In the event CITY desires the performance of additional services not otherwise included within the services described in Exhibit A, such services shall be authorized in advance of the performance thereof by the City Manager (for contracts less than \$50,000) or City Council (for contracts \$50,000 or more) by motion duly made and carried. Such amendment to this Agreement shall include a description of the services to be performed thereunder, the maximum compensation and reimbursement of costs and expenses payable therefor, the time of performance thereof, and such other matters as the parties deem appropriate for the accomplishment of such services. Except to the extent modified by written amendment, all other terms and conditions of this Agreement shall be deemed incorporated in each such amendment.
5. Records. CONSULTANT shall keep and maintain accurate records of all time expended and costs and expenses incurred relating to services to be performed by CONSULTANT hereunder. Said records shall be available to CITY for review and copying during regular business hours at CONSULTANT's place of business or as otherwise agreed upon by the parties.

6. Authorization. This Agreement becomes effective when endorsed by both parties in the space provided below.
7. Reliance on Professional Skill of CONSULTANT. CONSULTANT represents that it has the necessary professional skills to perform the services required and the CITY shall rely on such skills of the CONSULTANT to do and perform the work. In performing services hereunder CONSULTANT shall adhere to the standards generally prevailing for the performance of expert consulting services similar to those to be performed by CONSULTANT hereunder.
8. Documents. All documents, plans, drawings, renderings, and other papers, or copies thereof, as finally rendered, prepared by CONSULTANT pursuant to the terms of this Agreement, shall, upon preparation and delivery to CITY, become the property of CITY. Notwithstanding the foregoing, CONSULTANT will retain sole and exclusive ownership of all right, title and interest in and to its intellectual property and derivatives thereof which no data or confidential information of the CITY was used to create and which was developed entirely using CONSULTANT'S own resources. To the extent CONSULTANT'S intellectual property is necessary for the CITY to use the services provided, CONSULTANT will grant to the CITY a non-exclusive, royalty-free license to CONSULTANT's intellectual property solely for the CITY'S use of such services.
9. Relationship of Parties. It is understood that the relationship of CONSULTANT to the CITY is that of an independent contractor and all persons working for or under the direction of CONSULTANT are its agents or employees and not agents or employees of the CITY.
10. Schedule. CONSULTANT shall adhere to the schedule set forth in Exhibit A; provided, that CITY shall grant reasonable extensions of time for the performance of such services occasioned by governmental reviews of CONSULTANT's work product or other unavoidable delays; provided, further, that such unavoidable delay shall not include strikes, lockouts, work stoppages, or other labor disturbances conducted by, or on behalf of, CONSULTANT's officers or employees.

CONSULTANT acknowledges the importance to CITY of CITY's Project schedule and agrees to put forth its best professional efforts to perform its services under this Agreement in a manner consistent with that schedule.

11. Indemnity and Limitation of Liability. To the fullest extent allowed by law, CONSULTANT hereby agrees to defend, indemnify, and save harmless CITY and Estero Municipal Improvement District, its Council, boards, commissions, officers, employees and agents, from and against any and all claims, suits, actions liability, loss, damage, expense, cost (including, without limitation, costs and fees of litigation) of every nature, kind or

description, which may be brought against, or suffered or sustained by, City of Foster City or Estero Municipal Improvement District, its Council, boards, commissions, officers, employees or agents caused by, or alleged to have been caused by, the negligence, intentional tortuous act or omission, or willful misconduct of CONSULTANT, its officers, employees, subcontractors or agents in the performance of any services or work pursuant to this Agreement.

The duty of CONSULTANT to indemnify and save harmless, as set forth herein, shall include the duty to defend as set forth in Section 2778 of the California Civil Code; provided, however, that nothing herein contained shall be construed to require CONSULTANT to indemnify City of Foster City and Estero Municipal Improvement District, its Council, boards, commissions, officers, employees and agents against any responsibility or liability in contravention of Section 2782 of the California Civil Code.

CONSULTANT'S liability to the CITY and any other party for any losses, injury or damages to persons or properties or work performed arising out of in connection with this Agreement and for any other claim, whether the claim arises in contract, tort, statute or otherwise, shall be limited to the amount of the total fees due to CONSULTANT from CITY for the particular services giving rise to the claim. NOTWITHSTANDING ANYTHING TO THE CONTRARY IN THIS AGREEMENT, CONSULTANT SHALL NOT BE LIABLE FOR ANY SPECIAL, INDIRECT, CONSEQUENTIAL, LOST PROFITS, OR PUNITIVE DAMAGES SUSTAINED OR INCURRED IN CONNECTION WITH THIS AGREEMENT, WHETHER OR NOT SUCH DAMAGES ARE FORESEEABLE.

CONSULTANT's responsibility for such defense and indemnity obligations shall survive the termination or completion of this Agreement for the full period of time allowed by law.

The defense and indemnification obligations of this agreement are undertaken in addition to, and shall not in any way be limited by, the insurance obligations contained within this Agreement.

12. Insurance. CONSULTANT shall acquire and maintain Workers' Compensation, employer's liability, commercial general liability, owned and non-owned and hired automobile liability, and professional liability insurance coverage relating to CONSULTANT's services to be performed hereunder covering CITY's risks in form subject to the approval of the City Attorney and/or CITY's Risk Manager. The minimum amounts of coverage corresponding to the aforesaid categories of insurance per insurable event, shall be as follows:

<u>Insurance Category</u>	<u>Minimum Limits</u>
Workers' Compensation	statutory minimum

Employer's Liability	\$1,000,000 per accident for bodily injury or disease
Commercial General Liability	\$1,000,000 per occurrence and \$2,000,000 aggregate for bodily injury, personal injury and property damage
Automobile Liability	\$1,000,000 per accident for bodily injury and property damage (coverage required to the extent applicable to CONSULTANT's vehicle usage in performing services hereunder)
¹ Professional Liability	\$1,000,000 per claim and aggregate

Furthermore, the requirements for coverage and limits shall be the greater of either (1) the minimum coverage and limits specified in this Agreement or (2) the broader coverage and maximum limits of coverage of any insurance policy or proceeds available to the named Insured.

CONSULTANT agrees to include with all subcontractors in their subcontracts the same requirements and provisions of this agreement including the indemnity and insurance requirements to the extent they apply to the scope of the subcontractor's work. Subcontractors hired by CONSULTANT shall agree to be bound to CONSULTANT and CITY in the same manner and to the same extent as CONSULTANT is bound to CITY under this Agreement and its accompanying documents. Subcontractors shall further agree to include these same provisions with any sub-subcontractors. A copy of the indemnity and insurance provisions of this Agreement will be furnished to the Subcontractor upon request. CONSULTANT shall require all subcontractors to provide a valid certificate of insurance and the required endorsements included in the subcontract agreement and will provide proof of compliance to the CITY prior to commencement of any work by the subcontractor.

Concurrently with the execution of this Agreement, CONSULTANT shall furnish CITY, on the form included as Exhibit D or similar form, with certificates and copies of information or declaration pages of the insurance required hereunder to be included as Exhibit C hereto. With respect to evidence of commercial general liability insurance coverage, CONSULTANT must also include in Exhibit C the following original endorsements:

¹ Note: Professional liability insurance coverage is not required if the CONSULTANT is not providing a service regulated by the state. (Examples of service providers regulated by the state are insurance agents, professional engineers, doctors, certified public accountants, lawyers, etc.) Please check and initial the following if professional liability is **NOT** required for this agreement. ☐ Recommended _____ [Project Manager] ☐ Approved _____ [Risk Manager]

- (a) Any cancelled or non-renewed policy will be replaced with no coverage gap and a current Certificate of Insurance will be provided to the CITY
- (b) Naming the City of Foster City and Estero Municipal Improvement District, its Council, officers, boards, commissions, employees, and agents, as additional insureds; and
- (c) Providing that CONSULTANT's Commercial General Liability insurance coverage shall be primary insurance with respect to City of Foster City and Estero Municipal Improvement District, its Council, officers, boards, commissions, employees, and agents, and any insurance or self-insurance maintained by CITY for itself, its Council, officers, boards, commissions, employees, or agents shall be in excess of CONSULTANT's insurance and not contributory with it. CONSULTANT and its insurer may not seek contribution from CITY's insurance or self-insurance.

The limits of insurance required in this agreement may be satisfied by a combination of primary and umbrella or excess insurance. Only the Commercial General Liability insurance shall contain or be endorsed to contain a provision that such coverage shall also apply on a primary and non-contributory basis for the benefit of CITY, to the extent required by this Agreement, before the CITY's insurance or self-insurance may be called upon to protect CITY as a named Insured.

CITY reserves the right to obtain a full copy of any endorsements. Failure to exercise this right shall not constitute a waiver of right to exercise later.

Any and all Subcontractors shall agree to be bound to CONSULTANT and CITY in the same manner and to the same extent as CONSULTANT is bound to CITY under this Agreement. Subcontractors shall further agree to include the same requirements and provisions of this Agreement, including the indemnity and insurance requirements, in any agreement with sub-subcontractors to the extent that they apply to the scope of the sub-subcontractor's work. A copy of the indemnity and insurance provisions of this Agreement shall be furnished to any subcontractor upon request.

CONSULTANT shall maintain insurance as required by this Agreement to the fullest amount allowed by law and shall maintain insurance for a minimum of two (2) years following completion of this project or service. In the event CONSULTANT fails to obtain or maintain completed operations coverage as required by this Agreement, the CITY at its sole discretion may purchase the coverage required and the cost will be paid by CONSULTANT.

13. WORKERS' COMPENSATION. CONSULTANT certifies that he is aware of the provisions of the Labor Code of the State of California which require every employer to be insured against liability for workers' compensation or to undertake self-insurance in accordance with the provisions of that Code, and CONSULTANT certifies that he will comply with such provisions before commencing the performance of the work of this agreement.
14. NON-DISCRIMINATION. The CONSULTANT will not discriminate against any employee or applicant for employment because of race, color, religion, sex or national origin. The CONSULTANT will take affirmative action to ensure that applicants are employed and the employees are treated during employment without regard to their race, color, religion, sex or national origin. Such action shall include, but not be limited to the following: employment, advancement, demotion, transfer, recruitment, or recruitment advertising, layoff or termination, rates of pay or other forms of compensation, and selection for training, including apprenticeship. The CONSULTANT shall at all times be in compliance with the requirements of the Federal Americans With Disabilities Act (Public Law 101-336) which prohibits discrimination on the basis of disability by public entities. The CONSULTANT agrees to post in conspicuous places available to employees and applicants for employment any notices provided by the CITY setting forth the provisions of this non-discrimination clause.
15. Payment. The CITY shall pay CONSULTANT for its fees and reimbursable expenses (if applicable) within 30 days following the date of receipt of each applicable invoice. If CITY contests or questions any invoice, it agrees to raise any questions with management of CONSULTANT within such 30-day period. Late fees in the amount of 2% of invoice amount will accrue if current invoice is not paid within 30 days of payment due date of that invoice. If late fees are not paid, they will carry forward to next invoice.
16. Notice. All notices required by this Agreement shall be given to the CITY and CONSULTANT in writing, by first class mail, postage prepaid, addressed as follows:

CITY:	City of Foster City 610 Foster City Boulevard Foster City, CA 94404-2299 Attention: Maria Saguisag-Sid
CONSULTANT:	Koff & Associates, a division of Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc. 2835 Seventh Street Berkeley, CA 94710 Attention: Katie Kaneko
17. Non-Assignment. This Agreement is not assignable either in whole or in part.

18. Amendments. This Agreement may be amended or modified only by written agreement signed by both parties.
19. Validity. The invalidity in whole or in part of any provision of this Agreement shall not void or affect the validity of any other provision of this Agreement.
20. Governing Law. This Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California and any suit or action initiated by either party shall be brought in the County of San Mateo, California. In the event of litigation between the parties hereto to enforce any provision of the Agreement, the unsuccessful party will pay the reasonable attorney's fees and expenses of litigation of the successful party.
21. Mediation. Should any dispute arise out of this Agreement, the parties shall meet in mediation and attempt to reach a resolution with the assistance of a mutually acceptable mediator. Neither party shall be permitted to file legal action without first meeting in mediation and making a good faith attempt to reach a mediated resolution. The costs of the mediator, if any, shall be paid equally by the parties. If a mediated settlement is reached neither party shall be deemed the prevailing party for purposes of the settlement and each party shall bear its own legal costs.
22. Conflict of Interest. CONSULTANT may serve other clients, but none who conduct business that would place CONSULTANT in a "conflict of interest" as that term is defined in State law.
23. Entire Agreement. This Agreement, including Exhibits A, B C, and D, comprises the entire Agreement.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the parties hereto have caused this Agreement to be executed on the date first above written by their respective representatives duly authorized in that behalf.

CITY OF FOSTER CITY

Dated: 2/16/2022 | 12:25 PM PST

DocuSigned by:
Richa Awasthi
A971BBBF07CB430...
Richa Awasthi, Mayor

Dated: 2/16/2022 | 2:20 PM PST

ATTEST:
DocuSigned by:
Priscilla Schaus
6131E59FA33B4AB...
Priscilla Schaus, City Clerk

APPROVED AS TO FORM

Dated: 2/16/2022 | 11:30 AM PST

DocuSigned by:

09C9860F67434D3...
Benjamin Stock, City Attorney

KOFF & ASSOCIATES, A DIVISION OF
GALLAGHER BENEFIT SERVICES, INC.

Dated: 2/14/2022 | 5:10 PM PST

DocuSigned by:

949D8E7481754E6...
Georg S. Krammer, Managing Director

EXHIBIT A

SCOPE OF WORK AND SCHEDULE FOR COMPENSATION STUDY SERVICES

SCOPE OF SERVICES

The City desires human resources assistance to conduct a total compensation study. The current pay plan for the organization has several issues related to compression and inequities that have developed over the years and the City is looking to update their pay plan to attract and retain quality staff, provide salaries commensurate with assigned duties, provide justifiable pay differentials between individual classes, and maintain a competitive position with other comparable agencies in the area.

The City currently has 102 job titles in 6 position groups that it wishes to include in the study. These positions are broken into 5 compensation steps.

Position Group	Number of Job Titles
Executive Management	10
Other Management	45
AFSCME – Maintenance Unit	13
AFSCME – General Unit	19
FCPOA	7
Hourly/ Part-Time / Seasonal	8

The City is seeking at a minimum the following services:

- Review current compensation plan. Develop understanding of recruiting and retention of employees.
- Provide recommendation and identify consistent market position the City can strive to maintain.
- Recommend comparable public sector employers for compensation survey.
- Develop and conduct benefits survey
- Recommend appropriate salary range for each position based on classification plan, compensation survey results and internal relationships. Prepare new salary structure based on results.
- Identify extreme current compensation inequities and provide recommended corrective actions.
- Provide comprehensive training for Human Resources staff on new system.
- Provide periodic status reports on progress.
- Present information to Executive Leadership Team, unions, employees groups and City Council.

The study's goal will be to review the City's compensation structure for the studied classifications and to conduct a total compensation market survey (salaries plus benefits) using a set of appropriate comparator agencies. The identification of comparator agencies, benchmark classifications, and benefits to be collected is an iterative process that includes all stakeholders. We have found this open discussion philosophy to be critical to our success for organizational buy-in. Once the external data development is completed, we will make specific recommendations for internal equity for non-benchmarked classifications and classifications without a large enough market sampling.

The compensation study will contain specific recommendations regarding the integration of all study classifications into the City's compensation structure, with the goal of developing a clearly designed, internally equitable format that is flexible for career opportunity and future growth. Our study will make recommendations regarding a salary structure that takes the City's compensation preferences into consideration as well as the appropriate placement of each classification on the City's salary schedule.

The study includes a significant number of meetings with the Study Project Team, Executive Leadership Team, Human Resources, employees, union representation, and the City Council, as desired. We have expertise in labor/management relations and understand the importance of active participation by all stakeholders to ensure a successful outcome. The meetings and “stakeholder touch-points” that we recommend ensure understanding of the project parameters, enhance accurate intake and output of information, and create a collaborative and interactive approach resulting in greater buy-in for study recommendations. This interactive approach has resulted in almost 100% implementation success of K&A’s studies.

The majority of our clients are unionized and our larger city and county clients typically have multiple unions. Due to the multitude of stakeholder groups who are affected by any compensation study K&A conducts, our team understands the importance of accurate and validated data that withstands any scrutiny, effective and ongoing communication throughout each effort, and collaboration with the various stakeholder groups to ensure organizational buy-in to our findings and recommendations. We have developed a unique methodology of stakeholder “touchpoints” and collaboration that has made us highly successful and effective and has earned our team respect, agreement, and understanding from all stakeholders. In addition, we adjust and customize our methodology based on each individual client’s unique needs and circumstances.

We also recognize that both the City and union representatives have obligations to employees and members to ensure that any study is conducted in a fair and equitable manner. Our project work plans are designed for transparency and we strongly encourage dialog with all stakeholders on study deliverables so they in turn can express their concerns; we all have a shared goal of ensuring the process followed is fair and equitable.

This intense and comprehensive stakeholder engagement and our transparent study processes are also a mechanism of quality control. The fact that our information, data, and recommendations have to be able to withstand utmost scrutiny by diverse stakeholders require an in-depth multi-step quality control process for deliverables. This involves K&A team member validation of classification analyses and compensation data, K&A Project Manager review of all classification and compensation analyses, recommendations and deliverables, and finally K&A Principal (Project Director) review of deliverables before submittal to the client.

Total Compensation Study Objectives

- To make recommendations regarding a list of appropriate, logical and defensible comparator agencies, benchmark classifications, and benefits to be collected prior to beginning the compensation portion of the study;
- To collect accurate salary and benefit data from the approved group of comparator agencies and to ensure that the information is analyzed in a manner that is clear and comprehensible to the Study Project Team, Human Resources, management, employees, union representation, and the City Council;
- To carefully analyze the scope and level of duties and responsibilities, requirements for successful work performance, and other factors for survey classes, according to generally accepted compensation practices;



- To review the City's compensation structure and practices and develop compensation recommendations that will assist the City in recruiting, motivating, and retaining competent staff;
- To develop solutions that address pay equity issues, analyze the financial impact of addressing pay equity issues, and create a market adjustment implementation strategy supporting the City's goals, objectives, and budget considerations;
- To evaluate benefit offerings in the labor market and make recommendations for better alignment and/or different benefit offerings as indicated by the analysis and best practices;
- To create a comprehensive final report summarizing the compensation study approach and methodology, analytical tools, findings, and recommended compensation structure;
- To recommend appropriate internal salary relationships and allocate classes to salary ranges in a comprehensive salary range plan; and
- To ensure sufficient documentation and training throughout the study, on methods used to determine appropriate salary ranges, methods for logical progression of movement within the salary scale for each classification, and other practices, so that our recommendations can be implemented and maintained in a competent and fair manner.

Overall Objectives:

- To review and understand all current documentation, rules, regulations, policies, budgets, procedures, class descriptions, organizational charts, memoranda of understanding, personnel policies, wage and salary schedules, and related information so that our recommendations can be operationally incorporated with a minimum of disruption;
- To conduct start-up Study Project Team meetings with management, study project staff, and other stakeholders to discuss any specific concerns with respect to the development of compensation recommendations; finalize study plans and timetables; conduct orientation sessions with management, union leadership, and staff in order to educate and explain the scope of the study and describe what are and are not reasonable study expectations and goals;
- To work collaboratively and effectively with the City and its stakeholders while at the same time maintaining control and objectivity in the conduct of the study;
- To develop a compensation structure that meets all legal requirements, that is totally non-discriminatory, and that easily accommodates organizational change, growth, and operational needs;
- To document all steps in the process and provide documentation and training for Human Resources and other staff, as appropriate, in compensation analysis methodologies so that the City can integrate, maintain, administer, and defend any recommended changes after the initial implementation; and
- To provide effective ongoing communications throughout the duration of the project and continued support after implementation.

METHODOLOGY

TOTAL COMPENSATION STUDY

Deliverable A: Meetings with Study Project Team and Management Staff and Initial Documentation Review

During the initial meeting with the Study Project Team, we will discuss the compensation study factors that need to be agreed upon. This task includes identifying the City's Study Project Team (Human Resources, management, employee representation, etc.), contract administrator, and reporting relationships. Our team will conduct an orientation and briefing session with the Study Project Team to explain process and methodology; create the specific work plan and work schedule; identify subsequent tasks to be accomplished; reaffirm the primary objectives and specific end products; determine deadline dates for satisfactory completion of the overall assignment; determine who will be responsible for coordinating/scheduling communications with employees, managers, and other stakeholders; and develop a timetable for conducting the same.

Included in this task will be the gathering of written documentation, identifying current incumbents, and assembling current class descriptions, organizational charts, salary schedules, budgets, employment contracts, personnel policies, previous compensation studies, and any other relevant documentation to gain a general understanding of City operations.

City terminology and methods of current compensation procedures will be reviewed and agreed to. We will discuss methodology, agree to formats for compensation results, identify appropriate comparator agencies, benchmark classifications and benefits to be surveyed for compensation survey purposes. We will respond to any questions that may arise from the various stakeholders.

Deliverable B. List of Comparator Agencies, Benchmark Classifications, and Benefits to be Collected

During the initial meeting with the Study Project Team, we will discuss and agree to the compensation study factors. We will identify appropriate, logical and defensible comparator agencies that will be included in the external market survey, which will be the foundation for ensuring that the City's salaries for the studied classifications are competitively aligned with the external labor market. We will also identify those classifications that will be surveyed in the market (i.e., benchmark classifications), with the intention of internally aligning the remaining classifications with those that were surveyed.

Finally, we will determine the list of benefits that the City wants to include in the total compensation data gathering process.

1. Determination of Comparator Agencies

The selection of comparator agencies is a critical step in the study process. We typically use the following factors to identify appropriate comparators and will receive approval before proceeding with the total compensation study.

Our recommended methodology is that we involve management, Human Resources, employee representation, and the City Council, in the decision-making process of selecting which comparable agencies are included, **PRIOR** to beginning the study. Our experience has shown that

this is the most successful approach. The factors that we typically review when selecting and recommending appropriate comparator agencies include:

- **Organizational type and structure** – While various organizations may provide overlapping services and employ some staff having similar duties and responsibilities, the role of each organization is somewhat unique, particularly in regard to its relationship to the citizens it serves and level of service expectation. During this iterative process, the City's current/previous list of comparators, if any, and the advantages/disadvantages of including them or others would be discussed.
- **Similarity of population served, City demographics, City staff, and operational budgets** – These elements provide guidelines in relation to resources required (staff and funding) and available for the provision of services.
- **Scope of services provided** – While having an organization that provides all of the services at the same level of citizen expectation is ideal for comparators, as long as the *majority* of services are provided in a similar manner, sufficient data should be available for analysis. When reviewing this factor, the City's unique services would be evaluated in order to ensure that the majority of comparators provide the same services. This ensures that each comparator yields a sufficient number of matches for the City's jobs.
- **Labor market** – The reality of today's labor market is that many agencies are in competition for the same pool of qualified employees, because large portions of the workforce don't live in the communities they serve, are accustomed to lengthy commutes, and are more likely to consider changing jobs in a larger geographic area than in the past. Therefore, the geographic labor market area (where the City may be recruiting from or losing employees to) is taken into consideration when selecting potential comparator organizations. As part of this analysis, we will determine whether the City has identified agencies that it competes with for qualified talent; those agencies are taken into consideration for purposes of our analysis. It is important to understand and consider the City's competitive landscape and include agencies in the study to whom the City loses talent.
- **Cost-of-living** – The price of housing and other cost-of-living related issues are some of the biggest factors in determining labor markets. We review overall cost-of-living of various geographic areas, median house prices, and median household incomes to determine the appropriateness of various potential comparator agencies.

We typically recommend using 10-12 comparator agencies for all survey benchmarks in order to achieve statistical significance but are flexible and can easily use a different approach based on the City's preferences.

2. Determination of Benchmark Classifications

In the same collaborative manner as described in Step 1 above, we will work with the City's stakeholders to select those classifications that will be surveyed.

"Benchmark classes" are ordinarily chosen to reflect a broad spectrum of class levels. In addition, those that are selected normally include classes that are most likely to be found in other similar agencies, and therefore provide a sufficient valid data sample for analysis. Internal relationships will be determined between the benchmarked and non-benchmarked classifications and internal equity alignments will be made for salary recommendation purposes.



Due to the fact that the labor market typically yields reliable data, we recommend using approximately 60-65% of all classifications as benchmarks but we are happy to use a different model.

3. Determination of Salary and Benefits Data to Be Collected

In addition to base salaries, benefit data elements for a total compensation study normally include at least the following (which are generally available to all staff in a specific job classification): Employee Retirement, Retiree Healthcare cost, Health, Dental, Vision, and other insurance coverage, Vacation, Holidays, Administrative Leave, Deferred Compensation, Auto Allowance, and other benefits that the City wants to add.

- **Monthly Salary** – The top of the normal, published salary range. All figures are presented on a monthly or annual basis. We normalize the salary data to reflect number of hours in the work week and/or roll-up of retirement or other benefits in base salaries.
- **Employee Retirement** – This includes two figures: the amount of the employee's State or other public or private retirement contribution that is contributed by the agency and the amount of the agency's Social Security contribution.
- **Retiree Healthcare** – Given that healthcare costs are rising and retiree healthcare and liabilities increasing for many public agencies, we collect this information to capture the costs.
- **Insurance** – This typically includes Health, Dental, Vision, and other insurance coverage.
- **Leave** – Other than sick leave, which is usage-based, leave is the amount of days off for which the organization is obligated. We will discuss with the City whether leave days/hours should be converted to direct salary cost in dollars or represented in days/hours.
 - ❖ **Vacation:** The number of vacation days available to all employees after five years of employment.
 - ❖ **Holidays:** The number of holidays (including floating) available to the employee on an annual basis.
 - ❖ **Administrative/Personal Leave:** Administrative leave is normally the number of days available to management staff to compensate for the lack of payment for overtime. Personal leave may be available to other groups of employees to augment vacation or other time off.
- **Deferred Compensation** – We report any employer contribution made on the employee's behalf, whether dollar amount or percentage of salary, that does not require an employee-matching contribution. We can also report employer contributions that do require an employee match and would do so as a separate report.
- **Other** – This category includes any other benefits that are available to all employees within a classification and not already specifically detailed.

Deliverable C. Data from Comparators and Preliminary Analysis of Data

K&A does not collect market compensation data by merely sending out a written questionnaire. We find that such questionnaires are often delegated to the individual in the department with the least experience in the organization and given a low priority. Our experienced compensation analysts conduct all of the data collection and analysis to ensure validity of the data and quality control. This approach also ensures that we compare job description to job description and not just job titles, therefore ensuring true "matches" of at least 70%, which is the percentage we use to determine whether to include a comparator classification or not.

Objective factors in the whole position classification methodology include:

1. Decision making/judgment
2. Difficulty and complexity of work
3. Supervisory responsibilities
4. Non-supervisory responsibilities
5. Minimum qualifications
6. Working conditions/risk factors
7. Contacts

We typically collect classification descriptions, organization charts, salary schedules, personnel policies, budgets, master plans, operational information, MOUs, and other information via website, by telephone, or by an onsite interview. With the prior knowledge from the data gathered directly from each comparator agency and our experience in the public sector human resources field, our compensation analysts make preliminary “matches” and then schedule appointments by telephone, or sometimes in person, with knowledgeable individuals to answer specific questions. We find that information collected using these methods has a very high validity rate and allows us to substantiate the data for employees, management, and governing bodies.

Data will be entered into spreadsheet format designed for ease of interpretation and use. The information will be presented in a format that will identify the comparator positions used for each classification comparison. Information will be calculated based upon both average and median figures allowing the City to make informed compensation decisions. Other elements of the compensation survey report are agencies surveyed; comparable class titles; salary range maximum/control point; number of observations; and percent of the City’s salary range is above/below the market values.

In addition, we will include any type of statistical representation and analysis that the City desires such as 60th, 70th, or any other percentiles per the City’s compensation philosophy.

Benefits data will be displayed in an easy-to-read format. You will receive three sets of spreadsheets per classification, one with base pay, one with the benefits detail, and one with total compensation statistical data. In addition, we are often asked to collect “other” benefits (as listed in the benefits section above), which we typically report on a separate spreadsheet.

Deliverable D. Draft Compensation Findings/Additional Analysis/Study Project Team Meetings

As part of our transparent approach and communication strategy to ensure organizational buy-in to the study, we share the market survey with the organization. We first distribute our draft findings to the Study Project Team. After their preliminary review, K&A will meet with the Study Project Team and other stakeholders (including Human Resources, management, employees) to clarify data, to receive requests for reanalysis of certain comparators, and to answer questions and address concerns. This provides an opportunity for the Study Project Team and other stakeholders to review and question any of our recommended benchmark comparator matches. If questions arise, we conduct follow-up analysis to reconfirm our original analysis and/or make corrections as appropriate.

Deliverable E. Analysis of Internal Relationships and Alignment

To determine internal equity for all studied positions, considerable attention will be given to this phase of the project. It is necessary to develop an internal position hierarchy based on the organizational value of each classification. Again, we utilize the whole position analysis methodology as described earlier.

By reviewing those factors, we will make recommendations regarding vertical salary differentials between classes in a class series, for example, as well as across departments. This analysis will be integrated with the results of the compensation survey and the City's existing compensation plan.

The ultimate goal of this critical step in the process is to address any potential internal equity issues and concerns with the current compensation system, including compaction issues between certain classifications. We will create a sound and logical compensation structure for the various levels within each class series, so that career ladders are not only reflected in the classification system but also in the compensation system, with pay differentials between levels that allow employees to progress on a clear path of career growth and development. Career ladders will be looked at vertically, as well as horizontally, to reflect the City's classification structure.

Deliverable F. Compensation Structure and Implementation Plan

Depending on data developed as a result of the internal analysis, we will review and make recommendations regarding internal alignment and the salary structure (set of salary ranges, salary differentials, steps within ranges, and/or alternative compensation plans) within which the classes are allocated, based upon the City's preferred compensation model. We will also assist the City in developing a compensation philosophy and practices relative to the surveyed public jurisdictions, if desired. Finally, we will develop a proposed implementation plan based on the study results and recommendations, including calculating the cost of implementing the plan.

We will conduct a competitive pay analysis using the market data gathered to assist in the determination of external pay equity and the recommendation of a new base compensation structure, if desired. We will conduct a comparative analysis to illustrate the relationships between current pay practices and the newly determined market conditions and develop solutions to address any significant individual or group pay equity issues, analyze the financial impact of addressing pay equity issues, and create a market adjustment implementation strategy supporting City goals, objectives, and budget considerations.

Recommendations will also include guidelines to assist City staff with determining the starting pay for new employees based on knowledge and experience above the minimum requirements of the position, how difficult the position is to fill, and market competitiveness. We will also make recommendations and provide implementation strategies related to other key compensation practices, based on market demands, including pay for performance, skill pay, special assignment pay, certification pay, bilingual pay, promotional pay, and acting assignment pay.

Draft recommendations will be discussed with the Study Project Team and management for discussions and decisions on overall pay philosophy and the practicality of acceptance and prior to developing an Interim Report.

Deliverable G. Final Report and Guidelines for Implementation

A draft Interim Report of the Compensation Study) will be completed and submitted to the Study Project Team for review and comment. The report will provide detailed compensation findings, documentation, and recommendations. The report will include:

- An executive summary of the compensation study results;
- A set of all market data spreadsheets;
- A proposed Salary Range Placement document;



- A procedure to address employees whose base pay exceeds the maximum of their newly assigned pay range;
- Implementation issues and cost projections surrounding our recommendations; and
- A guide for rules, policies and procedures for the City in implementing, managing and maintaining the compensation system, as appropriate.

Once all of the City's questions/concerns are addressed and discussed, a Final Compensation Report will be created and submitted in the City's preferred format. The Final Report will incorporate any appropriate revisions identified and submitted during the review of the draft report.

Deliverable H. Formal Appeals Process

Should the City have an formal appeals process regarding the allocation of positions, this proposal does not cover time regarding a formal appeal process. Should our on-site participation be desired, our stated composite hourly rate will be honored. As mentioned above, however, our internal process usually addresses any of these issues.

Deliverable I. Final Presentation

Our proposal includes multiple meetings and weekly oral and written status/progress updates to the Study Project Team. Regarding the involvement of the City Council, etc., we recommend at least one initial meeting to identify the comparator agencies to be included in the study, one interim study session (to discuss the initial findings of the compensation study), and one final presentation of our Final Report. Of course, we are flexible regarding having more or less interaction with the Council, based on the City's preferences.



OPTIONAL SERVICES

Our approach and methodology, as described in this proposal, are very comprehensive and no additional optional services are being proposed. If the City desires formal training classes regarding classification and compensation methodologies, we would be happy to provide options for training services.



TIME REQUIREMENTS

Our professional experience is that total compensation studies of this scope and for this size organization take approximately three to four (3 - 4) months to complete, allowing for adequate compensation data collection and analysis, review steps by the City, the development of final reports, any appeals, and presentations.

The following is a suggested timeline (which can be modified based on the City's needs):

Deliverables	Total Compensation Survey	Completion by:
A.	Meetings with Study Project Team and Management Staff and Initial Documentation Review	Week 1
B.	List of Comparator Agencies, Benchmark Classifications, and Benefits to be Collected	Week 2
C.	Data from Comparators and Preliminary Analysis of Data	Week 10
D.	Draft Compensation Findings/Additional Analysis/Study Project Team Meetings	Week 12
E.	Analysis of Internal Relationships and Alignment	Week 13
F.	Compensation Structure and Implementation Plan	Week 13
G.	Final Report and Guidelines for Implementation	Week 14
H.	Formal Appeals Process *	As Needed
I.	Final Presentation	As Scheduled

EXHIBIT B
CONSULTANT'S FEE SCHEDULE



COST PROPOSAL

We have often found our process requires a very high level of time commitment, which sometimes results in a higher proposal cost. We believe that our methodology and implementation success rate is attributable to the significantly greater level of contact we have with employees, management, and the governing body. The time we commit to working with the employees (sharing of compensation survey data, informal appeal process, etc.) results in significantly greater buy-in throughout the process and no formal appeals at the end of the study.

Our clients always provide feedback that our process was professional, comprehensive, understandable, timely, and inclusive. Employees, although not necessarily always happy with our recommendations, have always indicated that we listened to their issues and concerns, were available for discussion, and able to provide documentation and data to support our recommendations. Although time consuming, we also drive the process to ensure that timelines are met and schedules are maintained.

For purposes for this cost proposal, we assume that, due to COVID-19, all meetings and presentations will be conducted virtually and not onsite travel will occur. We have several technological solutions that can easily facilitate the entire process. Of course, if the travel situation should change, we are more than happy to travel onsite to City offices, as needed, and adjust our cost proposal accordingly.

Deliverables	Total Compensation Study	Hours
A.	Meetings with Study Project Team and Management Staff and Initial Documentation Review	5
B.	List of Comparator Agencies, Benchmark Classifications, and Benefits to be Collected	12
C.	Data from Comparators and Preliminary Analysis of Data (this assumes 12 comparator agencies and up to 65 classifications)	260
D.	Draft Compensation Findings/Additional Analysis/Study Project Team Meetings	40
E.	Analysis of Internal Relationships and Alignment	12
F.	Compensation Structure and Implementation Plan	12
G.	Final Report and Guidelines for Implementation	12
H.	Formal Appeals Process *	0
I.	Final Presentation	5
	<i>Anticipated hours for additional unscheduled meetings and phone calls</i>	8
	Total Professional Hours – Compensation	366
	Combined professional and clerical composite rate: \$165/Hour	\$60,390
	Expenses are included in the composite hourly rate:	N/A
	<i>Expenses include but are not limited to duplicating documents, binding reports, phone, supplies, postage, parking, meals, travel time, etc.</i>	
	TOTAL PROJECT COST NOT TO EXCEED:	\$60,390
	<i>*Additional consulting will be honored at composite rate (\$165/hr)</i>	

EXHIBIT C
INSURANCE FORMS

1. Insurance Coverage Form